Case 5:20-cv-03642-EJD	Document 720-9	Filed 03/07/25	Page 1 of 6	
$\mathbf{H}_{i}$	KHIBI'			

09:01AM 1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
2	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
3	SAN JOSE DIVISION		
4	OPTRONIC TECHNOLOGIES, INC., ) CV-16-6370-EJD D/B/A ORION TELESCOPES & )		
5	BINOCULARS, A CALIFORNIA ) SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA CORPORATION )		
6	) NOVEMBER 14, 2019 PLAINTIFF, )		
7	) VOLUME 11 VS.		
8	) PAGES 1893 - 2003 NINGBO SUNNY ELECTRONIC CO.,		
9	LTD., SUNNY OPTICS, INC., MEADE ) INSTRUMENTS CORP., AND DOES )		
10	1-25,		
11	DEFENDANTS. )		
12			
13	TRANSCRIPT OF TRIAL PROCEEDINGS BEFORE THE HONORABLE EDWARD J. DAVILA		
14	UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE		
15	APPEARANCES:		
16	FOR THE PLAINTIFF: BRAUNHAGEY & BORDEN LLP BY: MATTHEW BORDEN		
17	J. NOAH HAGEY RONALD J. FISHER		
18	JEFFREY M. THEODORE  351 CALIFORNIA STREET, 10TH FLOOR		
19	SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94104		
20	(APPEARANCES CONTINUED ON THE NEXT PAGE.)		
21	OFFICIAL COURT REPORTERS:  IRENE L. RODRIGUEZ, CSR, RMR, CRR		
22	CERTIFICATE NUMBER 8074		
23	LEE-ANNE SHORTRIDGE, CSR, CRR CERTIFICATE NUMBER 9595		
24	PROCEEDINGS RECORDED BY MECHANICAL STENOGRAPHY TRANSCRIPT PRODUCED WITH COMPUTER		
25	IVANOCKILI BKODOCED MIIH COMBOLEK		

1	APPEARANCES: (CONT'D)
2	FOR THE DEFENDANTS:
3	SHEPPARD, MULLIN, RICHTER & HAMPTON LLP
4	BY: MICHAEL W. SCARBOROUGH DYLAN I. BALLARD
5	JOY SIU FOUR EMBARCADERO CENTER, 17TH
6	FLOOR SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
7	94109
8	SHEPPARD, MULLIN, RICHTER & HAMPTON LLP
9	BY: LEO CASERIA 333 SOUTH HOPE STREET, 43RD FLOOR LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90071
10	BY: THOMAS DILLICKRATH
11	SUITE 100 2099 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE, NW
12	WASHINGTON, D.C. 20006
13	ALCO DEFOUNT.
14	ALSO PRESENT:  BRAUNHAGEY & BORDEN LLP
15	BY: VICTORIA TONG, I.T.  LAURA VERGA, PARALEGAL
16	351 CALIFORNIA STREET, 10TH FLOOR SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94104
17	PEDER RUDLING LEGAL SERVICES BY: PEDER RUDLING
18	DI. TEDEK KODHING
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1 ARE, YOU KNOW, MILLIONS OF DOLLARS, BUT SMALL RELATIVE TO 04:24PM \$120 MILLION. 2 04:25PM DID YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO INVESTIGATE AND GET AN 3 04:25PM 04:25PM 4 UNDERSTANDING OF THE ALLEGATIONS THAT ORION WAS MAKING AGAINST THE DEFENDANTS AND SYNTA IN THIS CASE? 04:25PM 5 6 Α. YES, I HAVE. 04:25PM AND I DON'T KNOW IF YOU NEED TO NECESSARILY DESCRIBE 0. 04:25PM THOSE, BUT DID YOU PREPARE A SLIDE THAT HAD SOME OF THE SALIENT 8 04:25PM 9 ONES IN YOUR OPINION? 04:25PM 10 YES, THERE'S A SLIDE. THE NEXT ONE, PLEASE. 04:25PM Α. SO AGAIN, I DON'T WANT TO LIST OFF ALL OF THE ALLEGATIONS 04:25PM 11 04:25PM 12 OF CONSPIRACY BETWEEN SUNNY AND SYNTA, BUT THERE'S A LIST IN 04:25PM 13 FRONT OF YOU. 14 BUT SOME OF THE THINGS THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO AN ECONOMIST, 04:25PM WITHOUT GOING THROUGH THE LIST, ARE THE AGREEMENT ON PRICING. 15 04:25PM 16 SO YOU'VE GOT JOINT AGREEMENT, COMMUNICATION ABOUT PRICING, THE 04:25PM 17 EXCHANGE OF PRICE INFORMATION. 04:25PM 18 AND THEN THERE'S LOTS OF E-MAILS THAT I'VE SEEN THAT OR --04:25PM 04:25PM 19 AND THERE ARE ALLEGATIONS THAT SUNNY AND SYNTA AGREED TO AVOID 20 CONFLICT WITH ONE ANOTHER, AVOID PRICE WARS AND TO PROTECT ONE 04:25PM 21 ANOTHER IN ORDER TO MAKE THE INDUSTRY -- SO THAT THE THESE FOUR 04:26PM 22 COMPANIES, SUNNY, SYNTA, MEADE, AND CELESTRON CAN DOMINATE THE 04:26PM TELESCOPE INDUSTRY. 23 04:26PM 24 WHAT WAS THE TIME PERIOD, THE RELEVANT TIME PERIOD THAT 04:26PM Q. 25 YOU WERE LOOKING AT IN THIS CASE? 04:26PM

04:26PM	1	A. THANKS. NEXT SLIDE.
04:26PM	2	SO AS I SAID BEFORE, THE TIME PERIOD 2013 TO THE PRESENT,
04:26PM	3	SO NOVEMBER 2013 TO THE PRESENT, WAS THE TIME PERIOD THAT I
04:26PM	4	USED FOR COMPETING DAMAGES.
04:26PM	5	THERE ARE THERE'S SORT OF A QUESTION ABOUT TWO OTHER
04:26PM	6	TIME PERIODS.
04:26PM	7	BEFORE 2013, ORION ALLEGES THAT THE CONSPIRACY BEGAN WELL
04:26PM	8	BEFORE 2013, AND I'VE SEEN SOME INFORMATION THAT SUGGESTS THAT
04:26PM	9	THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH THE CONSPIRACY BEGINNING WELL BEFORE
04:26PM	10	2013.
04:27PM	11	AND THEN THERE'S ANOTHER PERIOD OF TIME BEGINNING IN 2016
04:27PM	12	WHEN THERE'S A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT ENTERED INTO.
04:27PM	13	AND BASED ON WHAT I'VE SEEN, THE CONSPIRACY CONTINUED, OR
04:27PM	14	THE EFFECTS OF THE CONSPIRACY CONTINUED BEYOND THAT SETTLEMENT
04:27PM	15	AGREEMENT.
04:27PM	16	MR. DILLICKRATH: OBJECTION, YOUR HONOR. DR. ZONA
04:27PM	17	SHOULD NOT BE TESTIFYING ABOUT HIS OPINION OF THE FACTS IN THE
04:27PM	18	CASE. HE SHOULD BE STICKING TO ECONOMIC OPINIONS.
04:27PM	19	THE COURT: ARE THESE FACTS RELATED TO HIS ANALYSIS?
04:27PM	20	MR. HAGEY: IT DOES, YOUR HONOR. I CAN ASK A
04:27PM	21	FOLLOW-UP QUESTION.
04:27PM	22	THE COURT: WHY DON'T YOU ASK A FOLLOW-UP QUESTION.
04:27PM	23	BY MR. HAGEY:
04:27PM	24	Q. AND DID YOU COME TO AN OPINION REGARDING ORION'S DAMAGES
04:27PM	25	FOR THE PERIOD FOLLOWING THE REFERENCED SETTLEMENT IN 2016?

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTERS
WE, THE UNDERSIGNED OFFICIAL COURT REPORTERS OF THE
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF
CALIFORNIA, 280 SOUTH FIRST STREET, SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA, DO
HEREBY CERTIFY:
THAT THE FOREGOING TRANSCRIPT, CERTIFICATE INCLUSIVE, IS
A CORRECT TRANSCRIPT FROM THE RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS IN THE
ABOVE-ENTITLED MATTER.
Ovene Rodriguez
Char Licardian
IRENE RODRIGUEZ, CSR, CRR CERTIFICATE NUMBER 8076
Spe-Asse Shorting
LEE-ANNE SHORTRIDGE, CSR, CRR CERTIFICATE NUMBER 9595
CERTIFICATE WOLDER 3030
DATED: NOVEMBER 14, 2019